NC Balance of State CoC Special Steering Committee Meeting Minutes – FY22 CoC Application Ranking Approval

September 6, 2022

Regional Leads Present: Derek Lancour *(abstaining)*, Kristen Martin *(abstaining)*, Tonya Freeman, Laurenn Singleton, Kristen McAlhaney *(abstaining)*, Natasha Elliot *(abstaining)*, Marie Watson, Denise Riggins, James Stroud, LaTasha McNair *(abstaining)*, Kit Claude *(abstaining)*, Tujuanda Sanders *(abstaining)*, Brian Fike *(abstaining)*

At-Large Members Present: Torie Keeton, Ellen Blackman, Angela Harper King, Lisa Phillips, Brooks Ann McKinney, Jeff Rawlings, Rachelle Dugan

SC Members Absent: Emily Locklear, Cassie Rowe, Tiffany Askew, Isaac Sturgill

Interested Parties Present: Kenett Melgar, Alyce Knaflich, Lori Watts, Bonnie Harper, Teresa Robinson, Lesly Delgado, Teena Willis, Arwen March, Kristen Martin, Leanne Greer, Christine Craft, Emily Lowery

NCCEH Staff Present: Brian Alexander, Laurel McNamee, Adriana Diaz, Debra Susie, Ashley VonHatten, Adrianna Coffee

Scoring Process & Project Applications

The CoC Consolidated Application has 3 parts:

CoC Application	Captures CoC-wide information
	NCCEH, as Collaborative Applicant, writes this application on the CoC's behalf
	Input from agencies, Regional Committees, Steering Committee, and stakeholders necessary to give full scope of the CoC's work
Project Applications	New projects
	Renewal projects
	DV Bonus project
	CoC Planning grant
Project Priority Ranking List	Ranked list of each project
	Recommended by the Project Review Committee
	Approved by the Steering Committee

- The project review committee plays a crucial role in the application process.

- Composed of one representative from each Regional Committee and interested at-large Steering Committee members (not grantees or applicants)
- Scores new and renewal project applications using approved scorecards
- Recommends ranked list of new and renewal project applications for CoC Collaborative Application to the Steering Committee for approval

- Scoring and ranking projects allows the CoC to prioritize funding for the best projects
  - Allows the CoC to prioritize funding based on HUD and CoC priorities and needs
  - Ensures the CoC prioritizes funding for projects that have high performance and manage funds well
  - Required by HUD
- NC BoS CoC has almost $14 million in homeless funding at stake in the FY22 CoC competition.

Potential Amount Available to NC Balance of State CoC Applicants	
Annual Renewal Demand (ARD)	$11,528,418
Bonus Funding	$742,192
DV Bonus	$1,484,383
CoC Planning (not scored or ranked)	$445,315
Projects will be ranked within 2 tiers	
Tier 1: 95% ARD	$10,951,997
Tier 2: ARD - Tier 1 + CoC Bonus + Domestic Violence Bonus	$2,802,996

  - On Friday afternoon, HUD released an updated PPRN for CoCs. The ARD remains the same, but the NC BoS CoC did see an increase in the amounts for bonus funding, DV bonus funding, and the CoC planning grant.
- Project ranking was informed by the CoC's Funding Priorities and the scorecards.
  - **NC BoS CoC Funding Priorit**ies
    - Guidance from the Continuum of Care on its priorities for funding. This includes priorities for funding specific project types and regional need.
  - **Scorecard**
    - *Thresholds:* Essential components that must be met in order to be funded.
    - *Standards:* High priorities for projects to ideally meet that indicate programmatic success.
    - *Minimums:* Meeting section minimums indicates well-rounded projects and that essential components are not missing that could affect performance.
    - *Points:* Used to incentivize practices and to pull higher performing projects up in the ranking list.
- PRC and NCCEH staff used approved scorecards to review applications.
  - Two Types of Scoring
    - Combined Scoring section of each application scored by:
      - One member of the PRC
      - One member of NCCEH staff
      - Combined Scoring section scores are averaged.

- Note: We had two PRC members that did not finish their application scoring. A second NCCEH staff member scored the 5 projects not scored by a PRC member so that each application had two scorers.
    - Staff Scoring section scored by NCCEH staff
- Combined Scoring + Staff Scoring = Total Score

FY22 CoC Application Summary

Applications scored and ranked	25 renewal project applications 18 Permanent Supportive Housing 7 Rapid Rehousing 6 new project applications 3 Permanent Supportive Housing 1 Rapid Rehousing 2 DV Bonus projects 1 Rapid Rehousing 1 SSO-CE
Applications not scored but ranked (typically ranked as first projects)	1 HMIS grant application 1 SSO-Coordinated Entry grant application
Applications not scored or ranked	1 Planning grant application

Renewal Project Review

Summary:

- 27 renewal projects turned in applications.
    - (1) HMIS project (not scored)
    - (1) SSO-Coordinated Entry project (not scored)
    - (18) Permanent Supportive Housing projects
    - (7) Rapid Rehousing projects
- Scored renewal projects:
    - (0) applications with threshold issues

Renewal applicants missed a range of standards.

Housing First Standard

Standards Missed	Number of Renewals
Housing First	1 agencies, 1 project

Key Elements and Benchmarks

Standards Missed	Number of Renewals
PSH Key Elements	3 agencies, 5 projects
RRH Benchmarks	4 agencies, 4 projects

The PRC identified two renewal projects with significant performance and standards issues.

- The Project Review Committee identified two renewal projects that deserved special consideration because of key standards issues, performance, and low scoring.
    - Rockingham County Help for Homeless RRH
        - RCHH Rapid Rehousing
            - Renewal application: $213,986
                - Met only 13/15 Rapid Rehousing Benchmarks
                - Missed the Anti-Discrimination Policy standard
                    - Scored zero points in the Equity Section
            - Scored 27% of possible points in the renewal scorecard
            - Scored 53% of the next lowest operating* RRH renewal application
                - RCHH scored 42.5 points – next lowest score was UCCS RRH at 77 points
            - Lowest ranking operational RRH project in 2021
        - This discounts the two RRH projects that have not started that received fewer points – the HUD NOFO does not allow us to reallocate first time renewals
    - New Reidsville Housing Authority PSH
        - New Reidsville Housing Authority PSH
            - Renewal application: $287,303
                - Met only 6/9 Permanent Supportive Housing Key Elements
                - Missed the Anti-Discrimination Policy standard
                    - Scored zero points in the Equity Section
                - Scored 22% of possible points in the renewal scorecard
                - Scored 50% of the next lowest PSH renewal application
                    - NRHA scored 41 points – next lowest score was RCHH PSH at 82 points
                - Lowest ranking PSH renewal in 2021
        - Angela asked if New Reidsville was offered technical assistance in 2021. Brian answered that the BoS offered it to all agencies in the CoC and set up an initial meeting with NRHA but they had not taken up the offer.

New Project Review

Summary:

- 8 new projects turned in applications.
    - (3) Permanent Supportive Housing projects
    - (3) Rapid Rehousing projects
    - (2) DV Bonus projects
        - Rapid Rehousing
        - SSO-CE
- Two new projects had issues:
    - Johnston-Lee-Harnett Community Action

        - JLHCA submitted by the first deadline but did not submit anything for the second deadline
        - Application materials not scored
    - Greene Lamp
        - Submitted a Planning grant application rather than a RRH grant application
        - Application materials not scored

New project comparison

Project	Project Type	Funding Priority	Thresholds Missed	Minimums missed	Total points
Brick Capital Community Development	PSH	1	0	4	59
Central Piedmont Community Action	RRH	3	0	3	52
Diakanos	PSH	3	0	2	73
Housing Authority of Greenville	PSH	3	0	2	77
NCCEH	SSO-CE	N/A	0	2	63.5
NC Coalition Against Domestic Violence	RRH	N/A	0	1	62

Most new applicants met all key thresholds and standards.

Housing First Standard

Standards Missed	Number of Renewals
Housing First	0 agencies, 0 projects

Key Elements and Benchmarks

Standards Missed	Number of Renewals
PSH Key Elements	0 agencies, 0 projects
RRH Benchmarks	1 agencies, 1 project

Ranking Options

The PRC used historical precedent and renewal performance to order the final ranking list.

- The Project Review Committee used several historical precedents including some key standards to order the final ranking list.
    - Housing First
    - Program Design Elements
        - Key Elements of Permanent Supportive Housing
        - USICH Rapid Rehousing Benchmarks
    - Anti-Discrimination Policy adherence

Precedent 1: Infrastructure applications

- CoC precedent is to rank the NC BoS CoC HMIS and Coordinated Entry applications at the top of the ranking list.

- Protects required infrastructure
- Funding Priorities document prioritizes infrastructure grants

Precedent 2: DV Bonus applications

- CoC precedent is to ranked DV Bonus projects at the bottom of the ranking list.
  - Two applications with far ranging impacts for DV survivors
    - NC Coalition Against Domestic Violence RRH
    - NCCEH Supportive Services Only – Coordinated Entry
  - Full DV bonus applied for by the two applications
  - Size could eliminate other projects, if higher in the ranking list

Precedent 3: Use Housing First, Program Design Standards, and Anti-Discrimination Policy Standards to order renewal projects.

- Pull down projects missing the Housing First standard
  - Applies to only one project: New Reidsville Housing Authority PSH
- Pull up projects in groups for the number of Key Elements of PSH or RRH Benchmarks met
  - Group by standards met and then order by point total
- Pull down projects missing the Anti-Discrimination Policy standard
  - Two agencies with three projects
    - Rockingham County Help for Homelessness: PSH and RRH
    - New Reidsville Housing Authority PSH
- Remember that Tier 1 projects are considered safe as long as they meet HUD threshold, the ranking order should indicate to applicants what the CoC wants to prioritize.
- Housing First and program design elements, PSH Key Elements / RRH Benchmarks, – long-standing precedent for ordering renewal projects – we've seen a significant effect on renewal applicants coming into compliance over time – so it's working to use this as a ranking tool precedent
- Because equity has been an emerging priority for the CoC over the last 3 years, the PRC and Steering Committee used including an Anti-Discrimination policy in compliance with the CoC's AD policy in their program policies & procedures as a ranking tool last year.

Precedent 4: Weight New Projects based on Funding Priorities document

- To ensure the CoC takes current CoC coverage into consideration, the CoC began weighting new projects applications based on their regional project priority.
  - Priority 1 projects: 20 points
  - Priority 2 projects: 10 points
  - Priority 3 projects: 0 points

The PRC ordered Tier 2 renewal and new projects by final score.

24	NC0446L4F032102		Trillium Health Resources	Trillium RRH		$212,039	$10,757,929	Renewal RRH	116
25	NC0198L4F032109		Rockingham County Help for Homeless, Inc.	RCHH Permanent Supportive Housing Renewal Grant 2021	TIER 1 Portion	$194,068	$10,951,997	Renewal PSH	82
					TIER 2 Portion	$75,132	$11,027,129		
26	New	1	Brick Capital Community Development (	Region 7 Permanent Supportive Housing		$298,658	$11,325,787	New PSH	59+20
27	New	3	Greenville Housing Authority	Project LIFE		$369,720	$11,695,507	New PSH	77
28	New	3	Diakonos, Inc.	FY22-23 PSH CoC Initiative		$140,000	$11,835,507	New PSH	73
29	New	3	Central Piedmont Community Action, In	Breaking Barriers		$275,547	$12,111,054	New RRH	52
30	NC0174L4F032112		Rockingham County Help for Homeless, Inc.	RCHH Rapid Re-Housing Renewal Grant 2021 NC0174L4F032011	TIER 2 Portion	$107,582	$12,218,636	Renewal RRH	42.5
					NOT FUNDED BELOW THIS LINE	$106,404	$12,325,040		
x	NC0176L4F032112		The New Reidsville Housing Authority	2021 Application for 2022-2023 CoC Renewal Tier One		$287,303	$12,612,343	Renewal PSH	41
			DV BONUS						
31	New	0	NCCEH	NC BoS CoC DV Bonus SSO-CE		$500,000		New SSO-CE	63.5
32	New	0	North Carolina Coalition Against Domes	Safe at Home Expansion		$984,383		New RRH	62
					DV Bonus Total	$1,484,383			

Recommended Scenario:

- Allows the projects fully in tier 2 to compete against one another based on scores
- All (4) new project applications would fully fall in tier 2 at their requested levels.
- The RCHH RRH project would be the last project in Tier 2, but not all of the renewal amounts could be funded. Because it's a RRH project a $51,974 project is probably still viable but $162,012 of its renewal amount would fall outside of the tier 2 line. The RCHH is the second lowest scoring project in the competition amongst all new and renewal projects.
- The NRHA PSH project would be fully outside tier 2 and off the ranking list.

Final Recommended Prioritization Ranking List

Rank	Grant Number	Funding Priority	Agency	Project Name	ARA / Request	Running Balance	App Type	Project Type	TOTAL
1	NC0035L4F032114		North Carolina Coalition to End Homelessness	2021 HMIS Renewal Balance of State	$519,299	$519,299	Renewal	HMIS	0
2	NC0384L4F032104		North Carolina Coalition to End Homelessness	2021 SSO CE Renewal Balance of State	$423,767	$943,066	Renewal	SSO-CE	0
3	NC0240L4F032106		Vaya Health	Vaya Health PSH Central Combo	$495,134	$1,438,200	Renewal	PSH	158
4	NC0255L4F032109		Vaya Health	Vaya Health PSH Western Combo	$435,590	$1,873,790	Renewal	PSH	153
5	NC0239L4F032108		Housing Authority of City of Greenville	Project Stable Solution Renewal 2021	$70,491	$1,944,281	Renewal	PSH	119
6	NC0204L4F032107		Trillium Health Resources	Trillium PSH #2	$121,632	$2,065,913	Renewal	PSH	115
7	NC0281L4F032108		Sixth Avenue Psychiatric	Pathways to Permanently Housed Consolidated	$328,141	$2,394,054	Renewal	PSH	114
8	NC0185L4F032112		Trillium Health Resources	Trillium PSH #3	$103,860	$2,497,914	Renewal	PSH	114
9	NC0183L4F032112		Housing Authority of City of Greenville	Solid Ground Renewal 2021	$74,028	$2,571,942	Renewal	PSH	107
10	NC0040L4F032114		Trillium Health Resources	Trillium PSH #1	$900,492	$3,472,434	Renewal	PSH	104
11	NC0159L4F032108		Housing Authority of City of Greenville	Seeds of Change Renewal 2021	$355,560	$3,827,994	Renewal	PSH	98
12	NC0237L4F032106		Housing Authority of City of Greenville	Project Hope Renewal 2021	$508,016	$4,336,010	Renewal	PSH	98
13	NC0221L4F032111		Community Link, Programs of	Community Link Northern PSH Combo	$1,338,019	$5,674,029	Renewal	PSH	92
14	NC0045L4F032114		Community Link, Programs of	Community Link Piedmont 1 PSH	$1,099,209	$6,773,238	Renewal	PSH	87.5
15	NC0465D4F032100		NC Coalition Against Domestic Violence	Safe at Home	$2,139,002	$8,912,240	Renewal	RRH	43
16	NC0466L4F032100		Sixth Avenue Psychiatric Rehabilitation Partners, Inc, DBA Thrive	Thrive Rapid Rehousing	$180,824	$9,093,064	Renewal	RRH	33.5
17	NC0358L4F032105		Eastpointe	Eastpointe Shelter Plus Care Southeast - Renewal 2021	$80,287	$9,173,351	Renewal	PSH	126
18	NC0042L4F032114		Partners Health Management	Partners Consolidated Renewal 2021	$273,381	$9,446,732	Renewal	PSH	114
19	NC0238L4F032106		Eastpointe	Eastpointe Shelter Plus Care 3 - Renewal 2021	$228,568	$9,675,300	Renewal	PSH	107
20	NC0262L4F032110		Eastpointe	Eastpointe Shelter Plus Care Combined - Renewal 2021	$199,127	$9,874,427	Renewal	PSH	106
21	NC0410L4F032103		Union County Community Shelter	COC Rapid Rehousing UCCS Renewal FY2023	$200,148	$10,074,575	Renewal	RRH	77
22	NC0409L4F032103		Pitt County	PittRRH2021	$123,278	$10,197,853	Renewal	RRH	88
23	NC0125L4F032113		Community Link, Programs of Travelers Aid	CL PRC RRH	$348,037	$10,545,890	Renewal	RRH	79.5

24	NC0446L4F032102		Trillium Health Resources	Trillium RRH		$212,039	$10,757,929	Renewal RRH	116
25	NC0198L4F032109		Rockingham County Help for Homeless, Inc.	RCHH Permanent Supportive Housing Renewal Grant 2021					
					TIER 1 Portion	$194,068	$10,951,997	Renewal PSH	82
					TIER 2 Portion	$75,132	$11,027,129		
26		New	1 Brick Capital Community Development (	Region 7 Permanent Supportive Housing		$298,658	$11,325,787	New PSH	59+20
27		New	3 Greenville Housing Authority	Project LIFE		$369,720	$11,695,507	New PSH	77
28		New	3 Diakonos, Inc.	FY22-23 PSH CoC Initiative		$140,000	$11,835,507	New PSH	73
29		New	3 Central Piedmont Community Action, In	Breaking Barriers		$275,547	$12,111,054	New RRH	52
30	NC0174L4F032112		Rockingham County Help for Homeless, Inc.	RCHH Rapid Re-Housing Renewal Grant 2021 NC0174L4F032011					
					TIER 2 Portion	$107,582	$12,218,636	Renewal RRH	42.5
					NOT FUNDED BELOW THIS LINE	$106,404	$12,325,040		
x	NC0176L4F032112		The New Reidsville Housing Authority	2021 Application for 2022-2023 CoC Renewal Tier One		$287,303	$12,612,343	Renewal PSH	41
			DV BONUS						
31		New	0 NCCEH	NC BoS CoC DV Bonus SSO-CE		$500,000		New SSO-CE	63.5
32		New	0 North Carolina Coalition Against Domes	Safe at Home Expansion		$984,383		New RRH	62
					DV Bonus Total	$1,484,383			

The Steering Committee needs to formally approve the prioritization ranking list. Marie Watson motioned for approval and Lisa Phillips seconded the motion. The motion to approve the NC BoS CoC Prioritization Ranking List for the 2022 CoC Competition was unanimously approved.

Next steps: Notification and Appeal Process

Staff will notify applicants regarding decisions by the end of the day.

- Staff will send scorecards to applicants and offer follow-up calls after the competition.
- Applicants whose projects were not included in the final Prioritization Ranking List can appeal decisions.

Appeals Process

- Appeal documentation due to NCCEH by Thursday, September 8th at 12 PM
- If appeals are submitted, the PRC will meet on Friday, September 9th to consider information.
- If the PRC recommends overturning a decision, the Steering Committee will consider approval of updated prioritization ranking list on Tuesday, September 13th at 10:30 AM.

Next Steering Committee Meeting(s):

- Tuesday, September 13, 2022, at 10:30 A.M. – **Regular Steering Committee Meeting**
- Tuesday, September 20, 2022, at 10:00 A.M. – **Special CoC NOFO Ranking Approval**
- Tuesday, September 27, 2022, at 10:30 A.M. **– *[Tentative]* Special CoC NOFO Appeals Meeting**